1	Kamala D. Harris			
2	Attorney General of California JAMES M. LEDAKIS			
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General MARICHELLE S. TAHIMIC			
4	Deputy Attorney General			
	State Bar No. 147392 600 West Broadway, Suite 1800			
5	San Diego, CA 92101 P.O. Box 85266			
6	San Diego, CA 92186-5266 Telephone: (619) 645-3154			
7	Facsimile: (619) 645-2061 Attorneys for Complainant			
8	BEFORE THE			
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION			
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA			
11				
12		Case No. 1000999		
13	Against:			
14	* · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	STATEMENT OF ISSUES		
15	NATUROPATHY, INC.; STEVE SCHECHTER, OWNER	·		
16	SCHOOL CODE: 3710431			
17	Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate An Institution Non-Accredited	·		
18				
19	Respondent.	,		
20				
21	Complainant alleges:			
22	PARTIES			
23	1. Joanne Wenzel (Complainant) brings this Statement of Issues solely in her official			
24	capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, Department of			
25	Consumer Affairs.			
26	2. On or about March 13, 2012, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education			
27	(hereinafter "Bureau") received an Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution			
28	Non-Accredited (Application #24563) from Natural Healing Institute of Naturopathy, Inc., Steve			
	1	1		

STATEMENT OF ISSUES (BPPE Case No. 1000999)

1				
1	Schechter, Owner (Respondent). On or about March 8, 2012, Steve Schechter certified under			
2	penalty of perjury to the truthfulness of all statements, answers, and representations in the			
3	application. The Bureau denied the application on June 30, 2015.			
4	JURISDICTION			
5	3. This Statement of Issues is brought before the Director of the Department of			
6	Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, under the			
7	authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Education Code unless			
8	otherwise indicated.			
9	4. Education Code Section 94886 states:			
10	Except as exempted in Article 4 (commencing with section 94874) or in			
11	compliance with the transition provisions in Article 2 (commencing with Section 94802), a person shall not open, conduct, or do business as a private			
12	postsecondary educational institution in this state without obtaining an approval to operate under this chapter.			
13	5. Education Code Section 94887 states:			
14	An approval to operate shall be granted only after an applicant has presented			
15	sufficient evidence to the bureau, and the bureau has independently verified the information provided by the applicant through site visits or other methods deemed appropriate by the bureau, that the applicant has the capacity to satisfy the minimum operating standards. The bureau shall deny an application for an approval to operate if the application does not satisfy those standards.			
16				
17				
18	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS			
19	6. Education Code (hereinafter "Code") section 94891, subdivision (b) stated that "[t]o			
20	be granted a renewal of an approval to operate, the institution shall demonstrate its continued			
21	capacity to meet the minimum operating standards."			
22	7. Code section 94909 states in part:			
23	(a) Except as provided in subdivision (d), prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student, either in writing or electronically, with a			
24	school catalog containing, at a minimum, all of the following:			
25	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
26	(2) Except as specified in Article 2 (commencing with Section 94802), a statement that the institution is a private institution and that it is approved to operate by the bureau.			
27				
28	(3) The following statements:			

	nature and extent of the placement services.		
1			
2	(15) The following statement:		
3			
4	"NOTICE CONCERNING TRANSFERABILITY OF CREDITS AND CREDENTIALS EARNED AT OUR INSTITUTION		
5	The transferability of credits you earn at (name of institution) is at the		
6	complete discretion of an institution to which you may seek to transfer. Acceptance of the (degree, diploma, or certificate) you earn in (name of		
7	educational program) is also at the complete discretion of the institution to which you may seek to transfer. If the (credits or degree, diploma, or		
8	certificate) that you earn at this institution are not accepted at the institution to which you seek to transfer, you may be required to repeat		
9	some or all of your coursework at that institution. For this reason you should make certain that your attendance at this institution will meet your		
	educational goals. This may include contacting an institution to which		
10	you may seek to transfer after attending (name of institution) to determine if your (credits or degree, diploma, or certificate) will transfer."		
11	(16) A statement specifying whether the institution, or any of its degree		
12	programs, are accredited by an accrediting agency recognized by the United States Department of Education. If the institution is unaccredited and offers an		
13	associate, baccalaureate, master's, or doctoral degree, or is accredited and offers		
14	an unaccredited program for an associate, baccalaureate, master's, or doctoral degree, the statement shall disclose the known limitations of the degree		
15	program, including, but not limited to, all of the following:		
16	(A) Whether a graduate of the degree program will be eligible to sit for the applicable licensure exam in California and other states.		
17	(B) A degree program that is unaccredited or a degree from an		
18	unaccredited institution is not recognized for some employment positions, including, but not limited to, positions with the State of California.		
19	(C) That a student enrolled in an unaccredited institution is not		
20	eligible for federal financial aid programs.		
21			
22	8. Section 94911 of the Education Code states in part:		
23	An enrollment agreement shall include, at a minimum, all of the following:		
24			
25	(c) In underlined capital letters on the same page of the enrollment agreement in		
26	which the student's signature is required, the total charges for the current period of attendance, the estimated total charges for the entire educational program,		
27	and the total charges the student is obligated to pay upon enrollment.		
28			

- (e) (1) A disclosure with a clear and conspicuous caption, 'STUDENT'S RIGHT TO CANCEL,' under which it is explained that the student has the right to cancel the enrollment agreement and obtain a refund of charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later.
- (2) The disclosure shall contain the institution's refund policy and a statement that, if the student has received federal student financial aid funds, the student is entitled to a refund of moneys not paid from federal student financial aid program funds.
- (3) The text shall also include a description of the procedures that a student is required to follow to cancel the enrollment agreement or withdraw from the institution and obtain a refund.
- (f) A statement specifying that, if the student obtains a loan to pay for an educational program, the student will have the responsibility to repay the full amount of the loan plus interest, less the amount of any refund.
- (g) A statement specifying that, if the student is eligible for a loan guaranteed by the federal or state government and the student defaults on the loan, both of the following may occur:
- (1) The federal or state government or a loan guarantee agency may take action against the student, including applying any income tax refund to which the person is entitled to reduce the balance owed on the loan.
- (2) The student may not be eligible for any other federal student financial aid at another institution or other government assistance until the loan is repaid.
- (h) The transferability disclosure that is required to be included in the school catalog, as specified in paragraph (15) of subdivision (a) of Section 94909.
- (i) (1) The following statement: 'Prior to signing this enrollment agreement, you must be given a catalog or brochure and a School Performance Fact Sheet, which you are encouraged to review prior to signing this agreement. These documents contain important policies and performance data for this institution. This institution is required to have you sign and date the information included in the School Performance Fact Sheet relating to completion rates, placement rates, license examination passage rates, salaries or wages and the most recent three-year cohort default rate, if applicable, prior to signing this agreement.'
- (2) Immediately following the statement required by paragraph (1), a line for the student to initial, including the following statement: I certify that I have received the catalog, School Performance Fact Sheet, and information regarding completion rates, placement rates, license examination passage rates, and salary or wage information and the most recent three-year cohort default rate, if applicable, included in the School Performance Fact sheet, and have signed, initialed, and dated the information provided in the School Performance Fact Sheet.'
- (j) The following statements:
- (1) 'Any questions a student may have regarding this enrollment agreement that have not been satisfactorily answered by the institution may be directed to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education at (address),

1	•••	
2	(12) A description of all student services;	
3	(13) Housing information including all of the following:	
4	•••	
5	(B) The availability of housing located reasonably near the institution's facilities and an estimation of the approximate cost or range of cost of the housing; and	
6	(C) If the institution has no responsibility to find or assist a student	
7 8	in finding housing, a clear and conspicuous statement so indicating. A statement that the program is "non- residential" does not satisfy this subparagraph.	
9	(14) Policies on student rights, including the procedure for addressing	
10	student grievances; and,	
11	(15) Policies on the retention of student records.	
12	17. Title 5, CCR, section 71930 states in part:	
13	···	
14	(b)(1) In addition to permanently retaining a transcript as required by section	
15	94900(b) of the Code, the institution shall maintain for a period of 5 years the pertinent student records described in Section 71920 from the student's date of completion or withdrawal.	
16 17	(2) Notwithstanding (b)(1), the institution shall maintain records relating to federal financial aid programs as provided by federal law.	
18	•••	
19	18. Title 5, CCR, section 74115 states in part:	
20	(a) This section applies to every set of financial statements required to be	
21	prepared or filed by the Act or by this chapter.	
22	(b) A set of financial statements shall contain, at a minimum, a balance sheet, an income statement, and a cash flow statement, and the preparation of financial statements, shall comply with all of the following:	
23	statements, shall comply with all of the following:	
24	(1) Audited and reviewed financial statements shall be conducted and prepared in accordance with the generally accepted accounting principles	
25	established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants by an independent certified public accountant who is not an employee, officer, or corporate director or member of the governing board of the institution.	
26	(2) Financial statements prepared on an annual basis as required by	
27	section 74110(b) shall be prepared in accordance with the generally accepted accounting principles established by the American Institute of Certified Public	
28	Accountants. Nonprofit institutions shall provide annual financial statements as	

3

4

20. From July 1, 2007 through December 31, 2009, there was no regulatory body with
oversight of private postsecondary schools because the former Bureau for Private Postsecondary
and Vocational Education sunsetted on July 1, 2007. On October 11, 2009, the Bureau for
Private Postsecondary Education Act of 2009 (SB 48 and hereinafter, "the Act") was signed into
law. The Act, which became operative on January 1, 2010, established the Bureau.

- 21. On April 24, 2012, the Bureau sent Respondent a letter advising that the Bureau could not grant Respondent a renewal of approval to operate because of deficiencies in the application, such as missing information regarding the institution's Articles of Incorporation and Bylaws and financial resources, among other things. On October 29, 2012, November 6, 2012 and February 27, 2013, the Bureau received Respondent's responses to the deficiency letter.
- 22. On September 30, 2013, the Bureau sent Respondent a second deficiency letter advising of the deficiencies that remained with Respondent's application. On March 10, 2014, the Bureau received Respondent's response to the deficiency letter.
- 23. On April 3, 2014, the Bureau sent Respondent a third deficiency letter advising of the deficiencies that remained with Respondent's application. On November 14, 2014, the Bureau received Respondent's response to the deficiency letter.
- 24. On June 30, 2015, the Bureau denied Respondent's Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate a Non-Accredited Institution and sent Respondent a "Notice of Denial."

FIRST CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Demonstrate Continued Capacity to Satisfy Minimum Operating Standards - Deficiencies in Enrollment Agreement)

- 25. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Education Code section 94891, subdivision (b), sections 94909, 94911, 94920 and title 5, CCR, sections 71700, 71716, 71800, 76215, for failing to demonstrate its continued capacity to satisfy minimum operating standards in that the enrollment agreement contains deficiencies as set forth below:
- a. The enrollment agreement failed to include the period covered by the enrollment agreement, as required by and title 5, CCR, section 71800(b).

- b. The enrollment agreement failed to state the date by which the student must exercise his or her right to cancel or withdraw, as required by and title 5, CCR, section 71800(d) and Code section 94920(b) and (d).
- c. The institution's refund policy, as set forth in the enrollment agreement, for withdrawal from a class prior to the first day of instruction is in violation of Section 94920(b). The institution's enrollment agreement states, "If you withdraw from a class prior to the first day of instruction, you are entitled to a full refund of tuition less than the non-refundable enrollment fee and a withdrawal fee." Section 94920(b) provides that students have the right to cancel the enrollment agreement and obtain a refund of charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later.
- d. The institution's policy, as set forth in the enrollment agreement, that refunds are only available if less than 40% of a class has been presented is in violation of Section 94920(d). Section 94920(d) provides that students who completed 60% or less of a period of attendance are entitled to a pro rata refund.
- e. The enrollment agreement failed to state in underlined capital letters on the same page of the enrollment agreement in which the student's signature is required, the total charges for the current period of attendance, the estimated total charges for the entire educational program, and the total charges the student is obligated to pay upon enrollment, as required by Code section 94911(c).
- f. The enrollment agreement failed to include the specific required language related to the Student Tuition Recovery Fund (STRF), as required by title 5, CCR, section 76215(a) and (b).
- g. The enrollment agreement failed to set forth the following disclosures required by Code section 94911(e), subdivisions (1), (2) and (3):
- (i) a clear and conspicuous caption stating, 'STUDENT'S RIGHT TO CANCEL,' under which it is explained that the student has the right to cancel the enrollment agreement and obtain a refund of charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later.

- (ii) the institution's refund policy and a statement that, if the student has received federal student financial aid funds, the student is entitled to a refund of moneys not paid from federal student financial aid program funds.
- (iii) a description of the procedures that a student is required to follow to cancel the enrollment agreement or withdraw from the institution and obtain a refund.
- h. The enrollment agreement failed to include a statement that, if the student obtains a loan to pay for an educational program, the student will have the responsibility to repay the full amount of the loan plus interest, less the amount of any refund, as required by Code section 94911(f).
- i. The enrollment agreement failed to include a statement that if the student is eligible for a loan guaranteed by the federal or state government and the student defaults on the loan, the federal or state government or a loan guarantee agency may take action against the student, including applying any income tax refund to which the person is entitled to reduce the balance owed on the loan and that the student may not be eligible for any other federal student financial aid at another institution or other government financial assistance until the loan is repaid, as required by Code section 94911(g), subdivisions (1) and (2).
- j. The enrollment agreement failed to include the transferability disclosure required by Code sections 94911(h) and 94909(a)(15).
- k. The enrollment agreement failed to include the specific required statements directing the student to the Bureau for unanswered questions and for filing a compliant with the Bureau, as required by Code section 94911(j), subdivisions (1) and (2).
- I. The enrollment agreement failed to include the statements acknowledging the student's receipt of the catalog, or brochure, and a School Performance Fact Sheet, prior to signing the enrollment agreement, and a line for the student to initial, as required by Code section 94911(i), subdivisions (1) and (2).
- m. The enrollment agreement failed to include verbatim the specific language above the student signature required by Code section 94911(k).

- n. The enrollment agreement failed to disclose that an institution offering a distance educational program where the instruction is not offered in real time shall transmit the first lesson and any materials to any student within seven days after the institution accepts the student for admission, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71716, subdivisions(a) and (d).
- o. The enrollment agreement failed to disclose that a distance education student shall have the right to cancel the enrollment agreement and receive a full refund pursuant to section 71750 before the first lesson and materials are received; that cancellation is effective on the date written notice of cancellation is sent; that the institution shall make the refund pursuant to section 71750; and that if the institution sent the first lesson and materials before an effective cancellation notice was received, the institution shall make a refund within 45 days after the student's return of the materials. These disclosures are required by title 5, CCR, section 71716, subdivisions (b) and (d).
- p. The enrollment agreement failed to disclose that an institution offering a distance educational program shall transmit all of the lessons and other materials to the student if the student has fully paid for the educational program and if the student requests in writing that all of the material be sent after having received the first lesson and initial materials. The enrollment agreement further failed to disclose that if an institution transmits the balance of the material as the student requests, the institution shall remain obligated to provide the other educational services it agreed to provide, such as responses to student inquiries, student and faculty interaction, and evaluation and comment on lessons submitted by the student, but shall not be obligated to pay any refund after all of the lessons and material are transmitted. These disclosures are required by title 5, CCR, section 71716, subdivisions (c) and (d).

SECOND CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Demonstrate Continued Capacity to Satisfy Minimum Operating Standards
- Financial Resources and Statements)

26. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Education Code section 94891, subdivision (b) and title 5, CCR, sections 71240, 71700, 71745 and 74115 for failing to demonstrate its continued capacity to satisfy minimum operating standards by demonstrating that

_,

the institution has and can maintain the financial resources required by providing current reviewed or audited financial statements as defined by title 5, CCR, section 74115.

27. The circumstances are as follows. On March 13, 2012, Respondent submitted bank statements with its application, however these are not financial statements as defined by title 5, CCR, section 74115(b). On November 6, 2012, Respondent submitted a profit and loss statement that was neither reviewed nor audited. On March 10, 2014, Respondent submitted financial statements that were neither reviewed nor audited. On November 14, 2014, Respondent submitted its 2012 tax returns. None of these submissions meets the requirement for providing current reviewed or audited financial statements that demonstrate the financial resources required by title 5, CCR, section 71745.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Demonstrate Continued Capacity to Satisfy Minimum Operating Standards - Catalog)

- 28. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Education Code section 94891, subdivision (b), sections 94909 and 94920, and title 5, CCR, sections 71700, 71810, 71930 an 76215 for failing to demonstrate its continued capacity to satisfy minimum operating standards in that the institution's catalog contained the following deficiencies:
- a. The institution's catalog did not include the specific beginning and ending dates defining the time period covered by the catalog, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(1).
- b. The institution's catalog did not include the statement that the institution is a private institution and that it is approved to operate by the Bureau, as required by Code section 94909(a)(2).
- c. The institution's catalog did not include a statement specifying whether the institution has a pending petition in bankruptcy, is operating as a debtor in possession, has filed a petition within the preceding five years, or has had a petition in bankruptcy filed against it within the preceding five years that resulted in reorganization under Chapter 11 of the United States Bankruptcy Code, as required by Code section 94909(a)(12).

- d. The institution's catalog did not include the statement encouraging prospective students to review the catalog and School Performance Fact Sheet prior to signing an enrollment agreement, as required by Code section 94909(a)(3)(B).
- e. The institution's catalog did not include a description of the facilities and of the types of equipment and materials that will be used for instruction, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(9).
- f. The institution's catalog did not include a description of library and other learning resources and the procedures for student access to those resources, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(10).
- g. The institution's catalog did not include the statement, "A student or any member of the public may file a complaint about this institution with the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education by calling (toll-free telephone number) or by completing a complaint form, which can be obtained on the bureau's Internet Web site," as required by Code section 94909(a)(3)(C).
- h. The institution's catalog did not include the statement, "Any questions a student may have regarding this catalog that have not been satisfactorily answered by the institution may be directed to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education at (address), Sacramento, CA (ZIP Code), (Internet Web site address), (telephone and fax numbers)," as required by Code section 94909(a)(3)(A).
- i. The institution's catalog did not include the specific language that addresses transferability of credits and credentials, as required by Code section 94909(a)(15).
- j. The institution's catalog did not specify whether the institution admits students from other countries and whether visa services are provided, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(3).
- k. The institution's catalog did not include a statement specifying whether the institution, or any of its degree programs, are accredited by an accrediting agency recognized by the United States Department of Education, as required by Code section 94909(a)(16).
- I. The institution's catalog did not include the specific required language related to the Student Tuition Recovery Fund (STRF), as required by title 5, CCR, section 76215(a) and (b).

- m. The institution's catalog contains withdrawal, cancellation and refund policies that are not compliant with Code section 94909(a)(8)(B) or the Bureau's regulations as follows:
- (i) The institution's refund policy, as set forth on page 9 of the catalog states, "If you withdraw from a class prior to the first day of instruction, you are entitled to a full refund of tuition less than the non-refundable enrollment fee and a withdrawal fee." Code Section 94920(b) provides that students have the right to cancel the enrollment agreement and obtain a refund of charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later.
- (ii) The institution's refund policy, as set forth in the catalog states that refunds are only available if less than 40% of a class has been presented. Code section 94920(d) provides that students who completed 60% or less of a period of attendance are entitled to a pro rata refund.
- n. The institution's catalog did not include a statement specifying that, if a student obtains a loan to pay for an educational program, the student will have the responsibility to repay the full amount of the loan plus interest, less the amount of any refund, and that, if the student has received federal student financial aid funds, the student is entitled to a refund of the monies not paid from federal student financial aid program funds, as required by Code section 94909(a)(11).
- o. The institution's catalog did not include the institution's standards for student achievement, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(8).
- p. The institution's catalog did not include a description of the institution's probation and dismissal policies, as required by Code section 94909(a)(8)(C).
- q. The institution's catalog did not include a description of the institution's leave-of-absence policies, as required by Code section 94909(a)(8)(E).
- r. The institution's catalog did not include the institution's policies on student rights, including the procedure for addressing student grievances, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(14).
- s. The institution's catalog did not include a description of all student services, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(12).

- t. The institution's catalog did not include a description of the nature and extent of the placement services, if the institution provides placement services, as required by Code section 94909(a)(13).
- u. The institution's catalog did not include a description of the availability of housing located reasonably near the institution's facilities and an estimation of the approximate cost or range of cost of the housing and if the institution has no responsibility to find or assist a student in finding housing, as required by title 5, CCR, section 71810(b)(13)(B)(C).
- v. The institution's catalog states that student records are retained for at least ten years after a student completes, or at least six years after withdrawal from, a program, however an institution is required to permanently retain student transcripts pursuant to title 5, CCR, section 71930(b).

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Demonstrate Continued Capacity to Satisfy Minimum Operating Standards
- Annual Report)

29. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Education Code sections 94891, subdivision (b) and 94934 and title 5, CCR, section 71700, for failing to demonstrate its continued capacity to satisfy minimum operating standards in that Respondent failed to submit complete Annual Reports for 2011, 2012 and 2013, under penalty of perjury and signed by a responsible corporate officer.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

 Denying Natural Healing Institute of Naturopathy, Inc., Steve Schechter, Owner, a Renewal of Approval to Operate and Offer Educational Programs for Non-Accredited Institutions; and,

27 | ///

28 | ///

1	2. Taking such other and fur	ther action as deemed necessary and proper.
2		
3	DATED: 3\3\16	JOANNE WENZEL
4 5		Chief Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education
6		Department of Consumer Affairs State of California Complainant
7		
8	SD2015802605 81226656.doc	
9		*
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22 23		
23	·	
24 25		•
25 26		
26 27		
28		
0 ـــ		2.1