1	ROB BONTA				
2	Attorney General of California JOSHUA A. ROOM				
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General CARTER OTT				
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 221660				
5	455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004				
6	Telephone: (415) 510-3485 Facsimile: (415) 703-5480				
7	E-mail: Carter.Ott@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant				
8		-			
9	BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS				
10	FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION STATE OF CALIFORNIA				
11		STATE OF CA	ALIFURNIA		
12					
13	In the Mat	ter of the Accusation Against:	Case Number BPPE22-673		
14		AN INNOVATION			
15	VALLEY	SITY, formerly SILICON UNIVERSITY	ACCUSATION		
16	2010 Forti San Jose,	CA 95131			
17	Approval Accredite	to Operate Institution Non- d Number 42693428			
18		Respondent.			
19					
20	<u>PARTIES</u>				
21	1. Deborah Cochrane (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in her official				
22	capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, Department of				
23	Consumer	Affairs.			
24	2. On or about May 24, 2021, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education (Bureau)				
25	issued Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited Institution Code Number 42693428 to				
26	Silicon Valley University, a California corporation. On or about May 7, 2024, the Bureau				
27	approved Silicon Valley University's request to change its name to American Innovation				
28	/////				
			1		

"(5) The directors, administrators, and faculty are properly qualified.

. . .

- "(8) Adequate records and standard transcripts are maintained and are available to students.
- "(9) The institution is maintained and operated in compliance with this chapter and all other applicable ordinances and laws."
 - 7. Section 94886 states:

"Except as exempted in Article 4 (commencing with Section 94874) or in compliance with the transition provisions in Article 2 (commencing with Section 94802), a person shall not open, conduct, or do business as a private postsecondary educational institution in this state without obtaining an approval to operate under this chapter."

8. Section 94932 states:

"The bureau shall determine an institution's compliance with the requirements of this chapter. The bureau shall have the power to require reports that institutions shall file with the bureau in addition to the annual report, to send staff to an institution's sites, and to require documents and responses from an institution to monitor compliance. When the bureau has reason to believe that an institution may be out of compliance, it shall conduct an investigation of the institution. If the bureau determines, after completing a compliance inspection or investigation, that an institution has violated any applicable law or regulation, the bureau shall take appropriate action pursuant to this article."

STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS

9. Section 94834 states:

"Distance education' means transmission of instruction to students at a location separate from the institution."

10. Section 94893 states:

"If an institution intends to make a substantive change to its approval to operate, the institution shall receive prior authorization from the bureau. Except as provided in subdivision (a) of Section 94896, if the institution makes the substantive change without prior bureau authorization, the institution's approval to operate may be suspended or revoked."

committed a violation, the bureau may place an institution on probation or may suspend or revoke an institution's approval to operate for:

. . .

- "(2) A material violation or repeated violations of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to this chapter that have resulted, or may result, in harm to students. For purposes of this paragraph, "material violation" includes, but is not limited to, misrepresentation, fraud in the inducement of a contract, and false or misleading claims or advertising, upon which a student reasonably relied in executing an enrollment agreement and that resulted, or may result, in harm to the student."
 - 15. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71630 states, in part:
- "(a) An institution seeking to change its name shall complete the 'Change of Name' form (NAME rev. 2/10) to obtain prior authorization. The form shall be submitted to the Bureau along with the appropriate fee as provided in Section 94930.5(c) of the Code. For an institution approved under section 94885 of the code it shall be signed and dated by the signatory(ies) required by section 71380, for an institution approved under section 94890 of the code it shall be signed and dated by the signatory(ies) required by section 71390, and each fact stated therein and each attachment thereto shall be declared to be true under penalty of perjury, in the following form:

"I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing and all attachments are true and correct.

"(Date)

""(Signature)"

- "(b) The application shall include:
- "(1) The name, school code, address, and telephone and fax numbers of the institution;
- "(2) The proposed new name;
- "(3) A detailed explanation of the reasons for the proposed change in name;
- "(4) Copies of advertising and other statements to be disseminated to the public in any manner by the institution or its representatives that announce or use the proposed name;

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

between students and faculty by such means as telecommunication, correspondence, electronic and computer augmented educational services, postal service, and facsimile transmission. In addition to the other requirements of this chapter and the Act, an institution offering distance education shall:

. . .

"(3) ensure that the materials and programs are current, well organized, designed by faculty competent in distance education techniques and delivered using readily available, reliable technology;

. . .

- "(5) maintain clear standards for satisfactory academic progress;
- "(6) timely complete student evaluations of learning outcomes by duly qualified faculty, which are appropriate for use with the distance education methods used, and evaluated by duly qualified faculty.
- "(7) employ a sufficient number of faculty to assure that (A) the institution's response to, or evaluation of, each student lesson is returned to the student within 10 days after the lesson is received by the institution; and (B) the institution's response to, or evaluation of, each student project or dissertation is returned to the student within the time disclosed in the catalog; and
- "(8) shall maintain a record of the dates on which lessons, projects, and dissertations were received and responses were returned to each student."
 - 18. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71740, subdivision (d)(2) states:
- "(d) An institution that depends for library and other learning resources primarily on other institutions' collections and resources not in its possession shall do all of the following:

. . .

"(2) Provide students and faculty with access to the regular services of a professional librarian or information specialist experienced in the electronic retrieval of information, who shall provide support for faculty in curriculum matters and actively serve as a resource guide for both graduate and undergraduate students."

////

19. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 74117 states:

"In addition to the requirement in Section 94913(b) of the Code, an institution that maintains a website shall provide on the homepage of that website clear and conspicuous links to all the items required in Section 94913(a) of the Code."

COST RECOVERY

- 20. Section 94937, subdivision (a) states that the "bureau may seek reimbursement pursuant to Section 125.3 of the Business and Professions Code."
- 21. Business and Professions Code section 125.3 provides, in part, that the Bureau may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case, with failure of the licentiate to comply subjecting the license to not being renewed or reinstated. If a case settles, recovery of investigation and enforcement costs may be included in a stipulated settlement.

<u>PART I – RESPONDENT'S WEBSITE</u>

- 22. Respondent maintains a website for its school, located at www.svuca.org.

 Respondent's website, in part, reads "Full Financial Aid Available." But Respondent is not accredited and therefore financial aid is not available to cover student tuition.
- 23. In addition, a review of Respondent's website showed that it does not contain student brochures provided by Respondent as well as a link to the Bureau's website.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Prohibited Business Practice – Untrue or Misleading Statement)

- 24. Respondent subjected its Approval to Operate to discipline for making untrue or misleading statements. (Educ. Code §§ 94937, subd. (a)(2) and 94897, subds. (j)(2) and (q)).) As stated in paragraph 22, above:
- a. Respondent made an untrue or misleading statement related to financial information, including information or records relating to the student's eligibility for student financial aid at the institution, in violation of Section 94897, subdivision (j)(2).

////

b. Respondent made a material untrue or misleading statement to a student or prospective student under the institution's authority or the pretense or appearance of the institution's authority, in violation Section 94897, subdivision (q).

SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Website Requirements)

- 25. Respondent subjected its Approval to Operate to discipline in that Respondent's institution website fails to contain clear and conspicuous links to all the items required by Section 94913(a). (Educ. Code §§ 94937, subd. (a)(2) and 94913, subds. (a)(3) and (a)(4); and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, section 74117.) In particular, as stated in paragraphs 22 and 23, above, Respondent's website fails to provide the following:
- a. Student brochures offered by the institution, as required by Section 94913, subdivision (a)(3); and
- b. A link to the Bureau's Internet website, as required by Section 94913, subdivision (a)(4).

<u>PART II – INSTRUCTION AND PROGRAMS</u>

- 26. In issuing Respondent's Approval to Operate, the Bureau granted Respondent provisional approval to offer, provide instruction in, and award a Masters of Science Degree in Computer Science via either direct instruction or hybrid instruction. Direct instruction "requires the physical presence of one or more students and one or more faculty members at the same location. Direct instruction includes instruction presented in a classroom, seminar, workshop, lecture, colloquium, laboratory, tutorial, or other physical learning settings consistent with the mission, purposes, and objectives of the institution." (Cal. Code Reg., title 5, § 71715, subd. (c).)
- 27. Hybrid instruction means a mix of direct instruction and distance education. Distance education "means transmission of instruction to students at a location separate from the institution" "by such means as telecommunication, correspondence, electronic and computer augmented educational services, postal service, and facsimile transmission." (Educ. Code §94834; and Cal. Code Reg., title 5, § 71715, subd. (d).)

////

- 28. Schools offering distance education use various online systems (referred to as "Learning Management Systems" or "LMS") to create, distribute, and manage the delivery of educational content. Schools offering distance education also may choose to offer a livestream of their instruction via a real-time video streaming software program (or "Livestream") such as Zoom. The Bureau previously approved Respondent's use of an LMS called "Moodle" and a Livestream program called "Big Blue Button" to provide distance education.
- 29. In or about July 2023, Bureau staff conducted an evaluation of Respondent's distance education methods, and found the following issues of concern:
- a. No instructional materials were found in the LMS. The textbook is identified, and the syllabus is posted; however, there are no accessible project prompts, exams, or other formal assessments. There is no observable evidence that "LMS is used for [. . .] required completion of course assignments and projects," as Respondent indicated when it obtained its Approval to Operate.
- b. It is not clear what a student is required to do because there do not appear to be any recent posts showing assignments or clarifications. Also, on or about July 27, 2023, via Respondent's Livestream, Bureau staff observed a professor asking a student repeatedly what work the student had done in a way that seemed to imply neither the professor nor the student were clear about what should have been completed during the previous week.
- c. Neither assessments nor a mechanism for formal assessment was observed; there were no assignments identified or deadlines noted in the LMS.
- d. The gradebook shows only these categories: Projects (a single-graded event), a Midterm, and a Final, totaling 100%. No actual required assessments, assignments, or deadlines were noted in the LMS.
- e. Outside of a brief disclosure in the syllabus that "[a]ll students are encouraged to use library-collected reference books," there is no evidence of a research requirement being articulated or enforced.

¹ https://docs.moodle.org/404/en/About_Moodle

² https://bigbluebutton.host/rtmp-live-streaming/

- f. Via Respondent's Livestream, the Bureau staff observed a professor (AT) providing instruction by narrating his work on SQL database coding and entries and occasionally interacting with the one student in attendance. AT reviewed the student's work aloud and explained why it was not "perfect." AT had an extremely casual, improvised presentation style with no set structure or evident lecture outline. The portion of the class session observed was more like a lab session than a lecture.
- g. The length of recorded sessions shows class is only meeting weekly for one to two hours on average. That is not sufficient class time for the units conferred as the classes are not meeting between 6:00 to 9:00 p.m. as scheduled, and three hours of lecture per week for 15 weeks is required for a three-unit course.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Distance Education Instruction)

- 30. Respondent subjected its Approval to Operate to discipline for failing to offer distance education instruction in compliance with California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715. (Educ. Code § 94937, subd. (a)(2); and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, § 71715, subds. (d)(3), (d)(5), (d)(6), (d)(7), and (d)(8).) In particular:
- a. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraphs (a) and (f), above, Respondent fails to ensure that the materials and programs are current, well organized, designed by faculty competent in distance education techniques as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715, subdivision (d)(3).
- b. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraph (b), above, Respondent fails to maintain clear standards for satisfactory academic progress as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715, subdivision (d)(5).
- c. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraph (c), above, Respondent fails to timely complete student evaluations of learning outcomes by duly qualified faculty, which are appropriate for use with the distance education methods used, and evaluated by duly qualified faculty as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715, subdivision (d)(6).

- d. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraph (d), above, Respondent fails to employ a sufficient number of faculty to ensure that (a) the institution's response to, or evaluation of, each student lesson is returned to the student within 10 days after the lesson is received by the institution; and (b) the institution's response to, or evaluation of, each student project or dissertation is returned to the student within the time disclosed in the catalog as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715, subdivision (d)(7).
- e. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraph (d), above, Respondent fails to maintain records of the dates on which lessons, projects, and dissertations were received and responses were returned to each student as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715, subdivision (d)(8).

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Inadequate Curriculum)

- 31. Respondent subjected its Approval to Operate to discipline in that Respondent's curriculum fails to comply with the requirements of California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71710, subdivision (a). (Educ. Code § 94937, subd. (a)(2) and; Cal. Code Regs., title 5, § 71710, subds. (a)(3)(C), (a)(4), (a)(5), and (a)(6).) In particular:
- a. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraph (a), above, Respondent's curriculum fails to include specific learning outcomes tied to the sequence of the presentation of the material to measure the students' learning of the material as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71710, subdivision (a)(5).
- b. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraph (a), above, Respondent's curriculum fails to include evaluation by duly qualified faculty of learning outcomes as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71710, subdivision (a)(6).
- c. As stated in paragraph 29, subparagraph (e), above, although Respondent's curriculum is degree-granting, the curriculum fails to require research of an appropriate degree that utilizes a library and other learning resources as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71710, subdivision (a)(4).

////

1	case, pursuant to Section 94937, subdivision (c) and Business and Professions Code Section		
2	125.3; and		
3	3. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.		
4			
5	DATED: <u>6/26/2024</u>	"Original Signature on File"	
6		DEBORAH COCHRANE Chief	
7		Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education	
8		Department of Consumer Affairs State of California	
9		Complainant	
10			
11	SF2023402410 / 44022608.docx		
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28		14	