1	ROB BONTA							
2	Attorney General of California JOSHUA A. ROOM Supervising Deputy Attorney General CARTER OTT Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 221660 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004							
3								
4								
5								
6	Telephone: (415) 510-3485 Facsimile: (415) 703-5480							
7	E-mail: Carter.Ott@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant							
8								
9	BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS							
10	FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION STATE OF CALIFORNIA							
11	STATE OF CA	ALIFORNA						
12	In the Matter of the Statement of Issues	Case No. BPPE24-0396						
13	Against:	Case No. BFFE24-0390						
14	CALIFORNIA UNIVERSITY OF BUSINESS, SCIENCE & TECHNOLOGY	STATEMENT OF ISSUES						
15 16	Application for Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited							
17	Respondent.							
18	D.A.D.C	n n n n n n n n n n n n n n n n n n n						
19	PART							
20	1. Deborah Cochrane (Complainant) brings this Statement of Issues solely in her official							
21	capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Po	stsecondary Education (Bureau), Department of						
22	Consumer Affairs.							
23	2. On or about May 28, 2021, the Bureau received an Application for Approval to							
24	Operate an Institution Non-Accredited (Application) from California University of Business,							
25	Science, and Technology (Respondent), owned by California University of Business, Science,							
26	and Technology Inc. Between July 2021 and February 2024, the Bureau and Respondent							
27	conferred regarding the Application, including about deficiencies the Bureau identified in the							
28	Application and Respondent's transmittal of additional application-related documents and							
	1							

. . .

"(9) The institution is maintained and operated in compliance with this chapter and all other applicable ordinances and laws."

7. Section 94886 states:

"Except as exempted in Article 4 (commencing with Section 94874) or in compliance with the transition provisions in Article 2 (commencing with Section 94802), a person shall not open, conduct, or do business as a private postsecondary educational institution in this state without obtaining an approval to operate under this chapter."

8. Section 94887 states:

"An approval to operate shall be granted only after an applicant has presented sufficient evidence to the bureau, and the bureau has independently verified the information provided by the applicant through site visits or other methods deemed appropriate by the bureau, that the applicant has the capacity to satisfy the minimum operating standards. The bureau shall deny an application for an approval to operate if the application does not satisfy those standards. The bureau may deny an application for an approval to operate institutions that would be owned by, have persons in control of, or employ institution managers that had knowledge of, should have known, or knowingly participated in any conduct that was the cause for revocation or unmitigated discipline at another institution."

STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS

9. Section 94828 states:

"'Curriculum' means an organized set of courses or modules of instruction that are prerequisites to the award of a degree or diploma."

10. Section 94830 states:

"'Degree' means a recognized educational credential awarded by an institution that signifies satisfactory completion of the requirements of a postsecondary educational program at the associate's level or above."

27 | ///

28 | ///

1	7	Section	0/1887	ctatec
1	,	36011011	9400/	STATES

"An approval to operate shall be granted only after an applicant has presented sufficient evidence to the bureau, and the bureau has independently verified the information provided by the applicant through site visits or other methods deemed appropriate by the bureau, that the applicant has the capacity to satisfy the minimum operating standards. The bureau shall deny an application for an approval to operate if the application does not satisfy those standards. The bureau may deny an application for an approval to operate institutions that would be owned by, have persons in control of, or employ institution managers that had knowledge of, should have known, or knowingly participated in any conduct that was the cause for revocation or unmitigated discipline at another institution."

- 18. Section 94897, subdivisions (j) and (u) state:
- "An institution shall not do any of the following:

.

"(j) In any manner make an untrue or misleading change in, or untrue or misleading statement related to: a test score, grade or record of grades, attendance record, record indicating student completion, placement, employment, salaries, or financial information; a financial report filed with the bureau; information or records relating to the student's eligibility for student financial aid at the institution; or any other record or document required by this chapter or by the bureau.

| .

- "(u) Fail to maintain policies related to compliance with this chapter or adhere to the institution's stated policies."
 - 19. Section 94909, subdivision (a) states, in part:
- "(a) Except as provided in subdivision (d), before enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student, either in writing or electronically, with a school catalog containing, at a minimum, all of the following:
- "(1) The name, address, telephone number, and, if applicable, internet website address of the institution.

. . .

"(5) A description of the programs offered and a description of the instruction provided in each of the courses offered by the institution, the requirements for completion of each program, including required courses, any final tests or examinations, any required internships or externships, and the total number of credit hours, clock hours, or other increments required for completion.

. . .

- "(8) A detailed description of institutional policies in the following areas:
- "(A) Admissions policies, including the institution's policies regarding the acceptance of credits earned at other institutions or through challenge examinations and achievement tests, and a list describing any transfer or articulation agreements between the institution and any other college or university that provides for the transfer of credits earned in the program of instruction. If the institution has not entered into an articulation or transfer agreement with any other college or university, the institution shall disclose that fact.

...."

20. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 70000 states, in part:

II .

- "(c) 'Chief academic officer' means the person primarily responsible for the administration of an institution's academic affairs including the supervision of faculty, development of educational programs and curricula, and implementation of the institution's mission, purposes and objectives.
- "(d) 'Chief executive officer' means the person primarily responsible for the overall administration of an institution, including the supervision of the chief academic officer and the chief operating officer. The chief executive officer is often, but need not be, called the 'president.'
- "(e) 'Chief operating officer' means the person primarily responsible for the administration of an institution's business operation, including finances, management, personnel, and contracting for goods, services, or property.

- | |

"(i) 'Degree program' means an educational program leading to the award of an academic degree as defined in section 94830 of the Code.

. . .

- "(r) 'Mission' means an institution's stated educational reasons to exist. A mission statement contains all of the following characteristics:
- "(1) The mission includes the institution's broad expectations concerning the education that students will receive, including the acquisition of the body of knowledge presented in the educational program, the development of intellectual, analytical, and critical abilities, and the fostering of values such as a commitment to pursue lifelong learning; and
- "(2) The mission relates to the educational expectations of the institution's students, faculty and community that the institution serves.
- "(s) 'Objectives' are the goals and methods by which the institution fulfills its mission and transforms it into measurable student learning outcomes for each educational program.

. . . . ,,

- 21. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71110, subdivision (e) states:
- "An institution shall provide the following information on the Form Application 94886:

•

- "(e) The name, address, email address, fax number and phone number of an individual who will function as the institution's contact person for the purposes of the Form Application 94886."
 - 22. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71140, subdivision (c) states:
- "(c) The institution shall identify the chief executive officer, chief operating officer, and chief academic officer and describe their education, experience, and qualifications to perform their duties and responsibilities."
 - 23. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71160 states:
- "The Form Application 94886 shall contain the name, work address, email address, fax number and telephone number of the person with whom the Bureau will correspond and conduct legal transactions on behalf of the institution."

///

28.	California	Code of R	legulations.	title 5.	section	71310.	subdivision	(b)) states:

- "(b) The description shall include the name, physical address, email address, and telephone number of the custodian of records, and the physical addresses and telephone numbers of the offices or buildings where the records will be maintained."
 - 29. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71340, subdivision (a) states:
- "(a) The institution shall include in the Form Application 94886 any material facts, which have not otherwise been disclosed in the Form Application 94886 that without inclusion would cause the information in the Form Application 94866 to be false, misleading or incomplete or that might reasonably affect the Bureau's decision to grant an approval to operate. In this context, a fact would be "material" if it would alter the Bureau's determination concerning the institution's ability to comply with any applicable provisions of the Act."
 - 30. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71400.5, subdivision (a) states:
- "(a) The inclusion of false or misleading information, or the intentional or negligent omission of pertinent information on any application may result in the denial of the application or a delay in processing, and may be grounds for action pursuant to Article 18 of the Act."
 - 31. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71710, subdivision (a)(2) states:
- "(a) In order to meet its mission and objectives, the educational program defined in Section 94837 of the Code shall be comprised of a curriculum that includes:

. .

- "(2) Subject areas and courses or modules that are presented in a logically organized manner or sequence to students;"
 - 32. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715 states, in part:
 - "(a) Instruction shall be the central focus of the resources and services of the institution.
- "(b) The institution shall document that the instruction offered leads to the achievement of the learning objectives of each course.

. . .

"(d) Distance education as defined in section 94834 of the Code, does not require the physical presence of students and faculty at the same location but provides for interaction

"2. a credential generally recognized in the field of instruction.

"(B) The degree, professional license, or credential possessed by the person shall be at least equivalent to the level of instruction being taught or evaluated;

. . .

"(6) When contracting for educational services, the institution shall maintain control of, and responsibility for, all academic matters, and shall assure that the instruction and faculty satisfy the standards established by the Act and this chapter;

. . . . ''

- 34. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71730 states, in part:
- "(a) Each institution shall have a chief executive officer, a chief operating officer and chief academic officer. One person may serve more than one function.

. . .

"(e) The chief academic officer shall possess a degree or equivalent acceptable experience at least equal to the highest qualifications required of the institution's faculty. Chief academic officers employed on the date of implementation of these regulations, who do not meet the qualifications for their positions, shall have three years to earn the necessary degrees or experience to qualify them for their position.

. ''

- 35. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71735, subdivision (a) states:
- "(a) An institution shall have sufficient facilities and necessary equipment to support the achievement of the educational objectives of all of the courses and educational programs in which students are enrolled. If an institution represents that the educational service will fit or prepare a student for employment in a particular occupation or as described in particular job titles, either of the following conditions shall be met:
- "(1) The equipment used for instruction or provided to the student shall be comparable in model type or features to equipment generally used in those occupations or job titles at the time the instruction is offered.

///

"(2) The institution shall establish that the equipment used for instruction or provided to a student is not obsolete and is sufficient for instructional purposes to reasonably assure that a student acquires the necessary level of education, training, skill, and experience to obtain employment in the field of training and to perform the tasks associated with the occupation or job title to which the educational program was represented to lead."

- 36. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71740 states, in part:
- "(a) A degree granting institution shall make available for student use a library and other learning resources.
- "(b) An institution shall provide or make provisions for the library and other learning resources needed to support each educational program it offers, including resources such as reference works, periodicals, monographs, and media and equipment specific to the educational programs offered.

. ''

- 37. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71770, subdivision (a) states:
- "(a) The institution shall establish specific written standards for student admissions for each educational program. These standards shall be related to the particular educational program. An institution shall not admit any student who is obviously unqualified or who does not appear to have a reasonable prospect of completing the program and shall describe in its admissions policy the criteria used by the institution to determine whether each student is qualified for admission to the educational program ("qualified candidate for admission"). In addition to any specific standards for an educational program, the admissions standards must specify as applicable that:
- "(1) Each student admitted to an undergraduate degree program, or a diploma program, shall possess a high school diploma or its equivalent, or otherwise meet the institution's criteria for a qualified candidate for admission, including minimum levels of prior education, preparation, skills, or training.
- "(2) Each student admitted into a post-baccalaureate degree program shall possess a bachelor's degree or its equivalent. If a graduate program leads to a profession or an occupation requiring state licensure and the licensing agency does not require that a member of the

- c. Respondent's Application fails to demonstrate that Respondent will assess each student, prior to admission, to determine whether each student has the skills and competencies to succeed in a distance education¹ environment, as required by California Code of Regulation, title 5, section 71715, subdivision (d)(2).
- d. Respondent's proposed catalog also fails to contain a detailed description of Respondent's admissions policies, as required by Section 94909, subdivision (a)(8)(A).

SECOND CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Method of Instruction and Learning Management System)

- 41. Respondent's Application is subject to denial in that Respondent proposes offering instruction to students via distance education methods using an online computer system, referred to as a "Learning Management System" (LMS). But Respondent's proposed distance education methods fail to comply with applicable law. (Educ. Code §§ 94834, 94885, subd. (a)(9), and 94897, subd. (u); and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71210, subd. (c)(5); 71715, subds. (d)(3) and (d)(5); and 71720, subd. (a)(6).) In particular:
- a. The Bureau staff is unable to verify that Respondent can comply with its stated policies related to course materials because the Bureau staff is unable to access the online, distance education materials Respondent represents students will have access to via its LMS. (Educ. Code § 94897, subd. (u).)
- b. Because the Bureau staff is unable to access Respondent's distance education materials, it is unable to verify that Respondent lists, for each education program offered, the method of instruction, as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71210, subdivision (c)(5).
- c. The content of Respondent's LMS does not establish that Respondent's materials and programs are current, well organized, designed by faculty competent in distance education techniques and delivered using readily available, reliable technology, as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715, subdivision (d)(3).

| | ///

¹ "Distance education' means transmission of instruction to students at a location separate from the institution." (Educ. Code § 94834.)

///

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Graduation Requirements)

- 43. Respondent's Application is subject to denial in that the portions of the Application titled "Instruction and Degrees Offered," "Description of Educational Programs," and "Catalog" contain contradictory statements related to what is required to graduate from Respondent's programs. (Educ. Code §§ 94885, subds. (a)(1), (a)(3), (a)(7), and (a)(9) and 94909, subd. (a)(5); and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71210, subd. (c)(6) and 71220, subd. (a).) As a result:
- a. Respondent will not be able to adhere to its own stated policies, as required by Section 94897, subdivision (u).
- b. Because those portions of the Application are required by law or otherwise by the Bureau, Respondent's contradictory representations constitute untrue or misleading statements related to a record or document required by the California Private Postsecondary Education Act of 2009 (Bus. & Prof. Code § 94800 *et seq.*) or by the Bureau, in violation of Section 94897, subdivision (j).

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Educational Program)

- 44. Respondent's Application is subject to denial in that Respondent failed to establish that the content of its proposed educational programs can achieve their stated objectives and otherwise has not demonstrated those programs are compliant with applicable law. (Educ. Code §§ 94885, subds. (a)(1) and (a)(9) and 94887; and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, ¶¶ 71715, subd. (b) and 71865, subd. (a).) In particular:
- a. Respondent's proposed Master's degree programs lack the equivalent depth to that normally acquired in a minimum of 30 semester credits or its equivalent or one year of study beyond the Bachelor's degree, as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71865, subdivision (a).
- b. Although Respondent offered the Bureau general access to its LMS, the Bureau is not able to access actual course materials, such as lesson plans, presentation materials, assignment prompts and rubrics, quizzes, and exams. As a result, Respondent failed to document

that the instruction seeks approval to offer would lead to the achievement of the learning objectives of each course, as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71715, subd. (b).

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Facilities and Equipment)

- 45. Respondent's Application is subject to denial in that Respondent has not established that its facilities are sufficient to enable students to achieve the educational program's goals or is otherwise compliant with applicable law. (Educ. Code §§ 94885, subds. (a)(3) and (a)(9); and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71260, subd. (b), 71340, subd. (a), 71400.5, subd. (a), and 71735, subd. (a).) In particular, Respondent's Application offers contradictory statements and details regarding Respondent's proposed facilities. As a result:
- a. Statements in Respondent's application appear to contradict the lease agreement Respondent offered. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, § 71400.5, subd. (a).)
- b. Respondent apparently failed to notify the Bureau in writing of changes in circumstances regarding this section of its Application and/or modifications in its lease agreement. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71340, subd. (a) and 71400.5, subd. (a).)
- c. The floorplan of Respondent's proposed facility appears to present a misleading characterization of the facilities available in that some of the rooms presented in the floorplan appear to be shared with other tenants and may require reservations or rentals on an asavailable basis. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71340, subd. (a) and 71400.5, subd. (a).)
- d. The document Respondent offered regarding its proposed facilities, one page of a lease agreement demonstrating payment, is not sufficient for the Bureau to establish that Respondent's facilities are compliant with applicable law, in part, because Respondent failed to submit to the Bureau documents referenced in the lease agreement, including Terms and Conditions and House Rules. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71260, subd. (b), 71340, subd. (a), 71400.5, subd. (a), and 71735, subd. (a).)
- e. Respondent's lease agreement provides for a month-to-month lease, which is not sufficient to satisfy California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71735, subdivision (a).

f. A different institution, as part of its application for approval to operate, submitted to the Bureau an identical lease agreement as that offered by Respondent. Respondent failed to disclose to the Bureau that it would be sharing its proposed facility. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, § 71400.5, subd. (a).)

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Library and Learning Resources)

46. Respondent's Application is subject to denial in that Respondent provided the Bureau with information demonstrating that it intends to use an online system for its library and other learning resources. But Respondent failed to provide the Bureau with access to that system so that the Bureau could establish that Respondent's system complies with applicable statutes and regulations. (Educ. Code § 94885, subd. (a)(3) and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71270, 71735, subd. (a), and 71740, subds (a) and (b).)

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(End of SN's Employment)

- 47. Respondent's Application is subject to denial in that a staff member (SN), whom Respondent formerly identified to the Bureau for purposes of its Application as Respondent's (i) contact person for the Application; (ii) Chief Academic Officer; (iii) statutory representative; and (iv) custodian of records, is no longer employed by Respondent. Respondent declined to identify an individual or individuals to serve in those roles. (Educ. Code §§ 94885, subd. (a)(9) and Cal. Code of Regs., title 5, §§ 71110, subd. (e), 71140, subd. (c), 71160, 71310, subd. (b), 71720, subd. (a)(4), and 71730, subds. (a) and (e).) As a result:
- a. Respondent failed to provide the name, address, email address, fax number and phone number of an individual who will function as the institution's contact person for the purposes of its Application, as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71110, subdivision (e).
- b. Respondent failed to identify its chief academic officer or described their education, experience, and qualifications to perform their duties and responsibilities, as required by California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71140, subdivision (c).

PRAYER 1 WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged 2 and that, following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a 3 decision: 4 1. Denying the Application for Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited in 5 California; and 6 2. 7 Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper. 8 9 7/31/2025 10 DATED: "Original Signature on File" DEBORAH COCHRANE 11 Chief Bureau for Private Postsecondary 12 Education Department of Consumer Affairs 13 State of California Complainant 14 15 SF2024401514 / 44460649.docx 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 20